1		
1	David C. Parisi, Esq. (162248)	
2	dparisi@parisihavens.com	
3	Suzanne Havens Beckman (188814)	
5	shavens@parisihavens.com	
4	PARISI & HAVENS LLP	
ا ہ	15233 Valleyheart Drive Sherman Oaks, CA 91403	
5	Telephone: (818) 990-1299	
6	Telephone. (010) 550 1255	
	Joseph H. Malley (not admitted)	
7	malleylaw@gmail.com	
8	LAW OFFICE OF JOSEPH H. MALLEY	
	1045 North Zang Blvd	
9	Dallas, TX 75208	
10	Telephone: (214) 943-6100	
10	Alan Himmalfanh (00480)	
11	Alan Himmelfarb (90480) THE LAW OFFICES OF ALAN HIMMEL	EADD
	80 W. Sierra Madre Blvd., # 304	
12	Sierra Madre, CA 91024	
13	Telephone: (626) 325-3104	
	consumerlaw1@earthlink.net	
14		
15	Attorneys for Plaintiffs	
13	IN THE UNITED ST	TATES DISTRICT COURT
16	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
17	FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA	
18	SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION	
19	OPPERMAN, ET AL.,	CASE No. 3:13-cv-00453-JST
20	Dlaintiffa	ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO
	Plaintiffs,	ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO CONSIDER WHETHER CASES SHOULD
21	v.	BE RELATED [CIV. L.R. 3-12(b)]
22	'	
		Hon. Jon S. Tigar
23	PATH, INC., ET AL., a Delaware	
24	Corporation;	
∠ 4	Defendant.	
25	Defendant.	
26		
27		
28		•

1 This document also relates to: CASE No. 3:13-cv-00432-LB 2 FRANCISCO ESPITIA, VANESSA Hon. Laurel Beeler ZENDEJAS, and JOE A. SANCHEZ 3 FRAIRE, individually and on behalf of a class of similarly situated individuals, 4 5 Plaintiffs, 6 v. 7 HIPSTER, INC., a Delaware Corporation; 8 9 Defendant. 10 11 I am a partner with Parisi & Havens LLP, a member of the bar of the State of 1. 12 California, and one of Plaintiffs' counsel in *Espitia*, et al. v. Hipster, Inc, Case No. 3:13-cv-13 00432-LB. I make this declaration based on personal knowledge. I am competent to testify to 14 the matters set forth here, and would testify if called upon to do so. 15 2. I make this declaration in support of the accompanying Administrative Motion to 16 consider whether the Espitia matter should be related to the above-entitled action, Opperman v. 17 Path, Inc. et al., Case No. 13-cv-00453-JST ("Opperman") and its previously related actions, 18 Gutierrez v. Instagram, Inc., Case No. 12-cv-06550-JST ("Gutierrez"), Hernandez v. Path, Inc., 19 No. 12-cv-01515-JST ("Hernandez"); and Pirozzi v. Apple, Inc., No. 12-cv-01529-JST 20 ("Pirozzi"), collectively ("the Related Actions") under Local Rule 3-12, such that duplication of 21 labor and expense may be avoided if all of the cases are heard by same judge. 22 3. On August 6, 2013, I contacted counsel for all parties in *Opperman* and the 23 Related Actions concerning this Administrative Motion and sought their agreement. 24 4. On August 7, 2013, I forwarded a draft copy of the Administrative Motion to all 25 parties in *Opperman* and the Related Actions for their review. 26 27 28

Case3:13-cv-00453-JST Document356-1 Filed08/09/13 Page3 of 3

1	5. On August 7, 2013, several parties, including the <i>Opperman</i> plaintiffs, <i>Pirozzi</i>	
2	plaintiffs, and defendants Yelp and Foodspotting, expressed their concern and/or objection to the	
3	Motion to Relate. Accordingly, Plaintiffs were not able to obtain a stipulation to relate <i>Espitia</i> .	
4	6. Attached as Exhibit "A" is a true and correct copy of the First Amended	
5	Complaint in <i>Espitia</i> , the operative complaint in that matter.	
6	I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that	
7	the foregoing is true and correct.	
8	Executed on August 9, 2013 at Orinda, California.	
9		
10	s/Suzanne Havens Beckman Suzanne Havens Beckman	
11	Suzume Havens Beekman	
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19 20		
$\begin{bmatrix} 20 \\ 21 \end{bmatrix}$		
$\begin{bmatrix} 21 \\ 22 \end{bmatrix}$		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	Declaration of Suzanne Havens Beckman in Support of Administrative Motion	